

Policy Implementation Green Public Procurement in Sustainable Development in South Kalimantan Province

by Irwan Tahir

Submission date: 07-Apr-2023 04:08PM (UTC+0700)

Submission ID: 2058281829

File name: Jurnal_Budapest_Husin_Asyari.pdf (706.17K)

Word count: 6425

Character count: 35555

Policy Implementation Green Public Procurement in Sustainable Development in South Kalimantan Province

Husin Ansari¹, Nurliah Nurdin², Irwan Tahir³, Dedeh Maryani⁴

^{1,2,3,4}Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri, Cilandak-Jakarta, Indonesia

husinansarirt@gmail.com

Abstract

The increasingly massive consumption of illegal paper, plastic and wood products contributes to increasing the potential for environmental damage. However, awareness of using environmentally friendly products is still low, including in government circles. In order to overcome these problems, the Provincial Government of South Kalimantan is the leading regional government that implements the Green Public Procurement (GPP) to align with sustainable development goals. However, the implementation of the policy is seen as still not optimal. This study intends to analyze the causes of the non-optimal implementation of GPP policies in South Kalimantan, which then formulates a model for implementing GPP policy. The qualitative research method was used by researchers with research data collected through interviews, observation and documentation studies techniques coding assisted by the Nvivo 12 program and combined descriptive analysis referring to the GPP framework theory from Akenroye, et.al. (2013) and Meter and Horn's (1975) policy implementation model theory. The study found that: 1) Policy implementation was not optimal due to the absence a road map in the policy action plan, lack of understanding and implementation of the GPP legal framework, low capacity of GPP regulatory and implementing authorities, lack of ecolabel environmentally friendly products, and lack of massive and intense socialization. IT DOESN'T MATTER; 2) The Sustainable GPP Policy Implementation Model is formulated by researchers as a model that emphasizes the alignment of policy implementation with environmental, social, and economic oriented sustainable development goals. The model consists of aspects. Researchers put forward suggestions: 1) academic suggestions, further research needs to develop the object of study and the theme Green Public Procurement in the procurement sector of other environmentally friendly goods and services such as green building and green road construction; 2) practical advice, the Provincial Government of South Kalimantan needs to develop a comprehensive Standard Operating Procedure as a technical guide for parties related to the procurement of government goods and services in implementing sustainable GPP.

Keywords

policy implementation green; public procurement policy sustainable; procurement of environmentally friendly goods and services.



I. Introduction

Development is a process of change towards better conditions through planned efforts aimed at improving people's welfare by involving supporting elements, namely human resources, natural resources and technology. These three things must be synergized well so that there are no impacts as a result of the development process both from an economic, social and environmental perspective. Sustainable development or "sustainable

development" is a development concept that pays attention to meeting the needs of the present without having to reduce the ability to meet the needs of future generations by paying attention to three pillars, namely aspects of economic growth, social aspects and environmental aspects.

In Indonesia, one of the causes of environmental damage is due to development policies that do not pay attention to sustainability, causing global warming and climate change due to increased concentrations of greenhouse gases in the atmosphere. There is an environmental quality index in it and the government, in this case the South Kalimantan provincial government, which is allegedly not able to be the front line in environmental care. The government's role in environmental sustainability, as Sadu argued, the government as the highest institution in a country needs to be a pioneer in maintaining the maintenance and balance of the environment, this has led to the emergence of "green government" or "green government", which is defined as a government that is environmentally aware and make various pro-environment policies. that all government officials become more aware of the environment, so that the various policies and actions taken need to be "pro green" and "pro sustainable development". (Wasistiono, 2013).

One of the efforts made by the government to reduce environmental damage and carry out sustainable development is to carry out green public procurement (GPP) government procurement which aims to improve environmental performance, efficiency in the use of energy, water, raw materials and pollution reduction. and greenhouse gas emissions.

Ilyas Asaad, as Expert Staff to the Minister of the Ministry of Environment and Forestry (KLHK) for Inter-Agency Relations at the opening of the Green Public Procurement (GPP) Nation Wide Promotion workshop in Jakarta (29/08/2017) added that Green Public Procurement in addition to saving state spending, also contributes to improving the quality of the environment. Agus Pudjijo needed this statement, the main reason for using Green Public Procurement as an environmental policy instrument is because of the large increase in government procurement of goods and services for natural resources that can directly or indirectly affect nature. , environmental pollution, biodiversity, and climate change. The impact on nature is not only seen from the use of raw materials/materials in significant quantities, but the emissions generated in the process and implementation of goods and services starting from production, transportation, to the stages of use.

Green Public Procurement policies in several provinces in Indonesia are still relatively few, the Provincial Government is still not serious in implementing environmentally friendly procurement policies, this can be seen from the minimum regulations issued to support Green Public Procurement. Provinces in Indonesia that earlier made policies in the form of the Governor of South Kalimantan Province Regulation Number 093 of 2018 concerning Green Public Procurement. The application of the GPP policy which only applies to these 3 products refers to Presidential Regulation Number 16 of 2018 concerning Government Procurement of Goods/Services and its amendments and Circular Letter of the Government Goods and Services Procurement Policy Institute (LKPP) Number 16 of 2020 concerning the determination of green products/green industrial products. to be used in the sustainable procurement of government goods/services.

the procurement of goods/services, pay attention to economic aspects that play a role in the production of goods/services throughout the life of the goods/services, guarantee fair working conditions, empowerment of local communities, as well as

²² environmental aspect²³ including reducing negative impacts on health, air quality, and use of natural resources. in accordance with the provisions of the legislation.

Based on the general procurement plan information system submitted by all regional device organizations on the electronic procurement service site on the <https://sirup.lkpp.go.id/sirup/home/pencarian> page as of July 5, 2020 at 15.30 WITA, information was obtained that the total procurement of goods in 2019 amounted to Rp. 731,675,389,862,- in 2020 of Rp. 653,209,960,511,-, then for the year 2021 the amount of office stationery procurement is Rp. 23,292,409,480, of the total expenditure it is ²⁷ known how many products that use ecolabels are used by the government, so the implementation of green public procurement policies is said to have not been carried out optimally.

¹ The amount of the budget for the procurement of goods and services, if supported by good policies, and the implementation of these policies is carried out properly, will contribute greatly to supporting sustainable development goals in the province of South Kalimantan. Directly and indirectly, GPP can achieve sustainable development goals from aspects of environmental improvement, efficiency in the use of raw materials, water and energy, reducing environmental pollution and greenhouse gas emissions, as well as encouraging the growth of ¹ green industries that produce innovations for products that are environmentally friendly. environmentally friendly. On the other hand, if the GPP policy is not implemented, it will have an even greater impact on the extent of environmental damage.

²⁴ According to Michael Hill and Peter Hupe in their book entitled "Implementing Public Policy: Governance in Theory and in Practice" ideally policy is seen as a decision that identifies problems and then looks for various ways of solving them by showing the structure of policy implementation that can be followed by policy implementers. Thus, policy implementation is a problem solving process carried out in certain ways into the policy¹¹ implementation process.

Van Meter and Van Horn define implementation as actions taken both by individuals and by government or private groups that are directed at achieving the objectives of the policy. Meter and Horn also explained that the determinant of the success of a policy can be seen from planning by 20% (twenty percent) and implementation by 60% (sixty percent), ¹⁷ rest is how to control the implementation. Another opinion is according to Edwards III (1980) that the problem in public policy is the lack of attention to implementation. In fact, public policies require the skills of their implementers, which then develop towards certain preconditions needed in policy implementation. According to Edwards III, there are four factors in creating a successful policy implementation, namely communication, sources, tendencies or dispositions, and implementation structure.

The policy implementation model according to Mazmanian and Sebatier (1983) there are three variables that affect a policy implementation, namely: First, the characteristics of the problem; Second, or the characteristics of the policy/law; Third, environmental variables. According to Wibawa, Mazmanian and Sabatier (1983) thought that an implementation would be effective if the implementer complied with the existing regulations.

The policy implementation model of Meter and Horn is based on the consideration that the GPP policy is a top-down policy, so that logic of thinking is used from above and then does a downward mapping to see the success or failure of a policy implementation. In addition, the analytical approach in the ¹ top-down implementation model as the identical Horn and Meter model is said to be a policy centered approach because the focus of the researchers' attention is only on policies and trying to obtain facts whether a policy is

effective or not. Meanwhile, Edwards III's policy implementation model rests on the view of one stage of public policy, between policy formation and policy consequences for the people it affects. While the Grindle implementation model measures the extent to which the policy objectives outlined in the planned program of activities and individual projects can be implemented through activities that are influenced by certain variables that have an impact on communities, individuals, groups and acceptable changes.

According to Meter and Horn, the task of implementation is to build a network that enables public policy objectives to be realized through the activities of government agencies involving various interested parties. Change, control, and compliance in action are important concepts in the implementation procedure. Both develop a policy typology according to: (i) the number of changes to be produced, and (ii) the extent or scope of agreement on objectives by the various parties involved in the implementation process. While the Grindle model argues that implementation is a general process of administrative action that can be investigated at the level of a particular program.

From several policy implementation models, the Van Meter and Van Horn (1975) model was chosen by researchers as Policy Implementation to analyze GPP policies, on the grounds that six performance indicators are important stages in policy analysis to design GPP policy implementation models that are in line with sustainable development goals in Indonesia. South Kalimantan Province.

II. Research Method

The research methodology is a way to determine the scientific level of a research result and seeks to strengthen the existing truth and understand the phenomena or symptoms that occur in the community, this is in line with the opinion of Moh. Nazir who stated that research is a process of searching for something systematically over a long time by using scientific and applicable rules. To apply scientific methodology in research practice, it is necessary to design or research models that are in accordance with the conditions, balance with the depth of the research being carried out.

Meanwhile, according to Neuman in terms of usability and audience, research is divided into two, namely first, basic research, namely research designed for fundamental knowledge about how the world works and building/testing theoretical explanations by focusing on the question "why" The scientific community is the audience. mainly, secondly, applied research, namely research designed to offer practical solutions to concrete problems or address the immediate and specific needs of practitioners. This study aims to solve practical problems, so if viewed from its usefulness, this research is an applied research.

The approach used in this research is a qualitative approach, with an exploratory method. Locke, Spridoso and Silferman stated: "qualitative research is interpretative research. As such, the biases, values and judgment of the researchers become stated explicitly in the research report. Such openness is considered to be useful and positive." Then according to Bogman and Taylor qualitative research methods as research procedures that produce descriptive data in the form of written or spoken words from people and observable behavior. Qualitative research prefers the direction of guidance in the preparation of substantive theories based on data.

The use of this research method is in accordance with what was stated by Strauss and Corbin: "qualitative methods can be used to uncover and understand what lies behind any phenomenon about which little is yet known, qualitative methods can give the indicate details of a phenomenon that are difficult to convey with quantitative methods."

III. Result and Discussion

3.1 Action Plan

The first dimension describes the causes of the non-optimal implementation of policies related to GPP in the province of South Kalimantan from the perspective of an action plan. This dimension includes several aspects, namely policy road maps, sustainable consumption strategies, carbon emission reduction programs, and the use of environmentally friendly products. Nvivo data processing related to the perspective of the action plan aspect in knowing the causes of the non-optimal implementation of the GPP policy in South Kalimantan, as presented in Table 5.1, it is known that the action plan theme has the most substance linkages with the government theme as many as 21 times stated in the interview primary data. Likewise, the theme of the witness plan has a substance linkage with the system and infrastructure theme, which was raised 18 times. Then, the analysis map in the project map as shown in Figure 5.2 shows that the government, systems and infrastructure are related to the causes of the non-optimal implementation of the GPP policy from the perspective of the action plan.

Action plans are very important for the smooth running of governance, because one of the functions of government as stated by Rasyid, the function of government in terms of service functions, development functions and empowerment functions always places planning first. One of the indicators or forms of manifestation of the action plan is a road map. A road map is interpreted as a road map that is used as a direction. Generally, a road map is in the form of a document that contains a detailed plan regarding the strategic stages to be carried out and makes it a reference for implementing a program. In addition, these documents serve as guidelines in responding to various dynamics to achieve a goal.

Regarding the GPP policy road map being implemented, from the information given by several informants, it was found that this GPP policy does not yet have a road map that can be used as a reference for action plans. As stated by the informant that there is no road map related to the implementation of the GPP policy, other informants' statements are similar, stating that they have not been able to describe the road map for this GPP policy. Similarly, the informant said:

I haven't heard what the road map is like. The South Kalimantan government should publish its own road map, what are the main objectives, what are the targets for achieving in the past few years. So this is also a weakness. Likewise, the informant conveyed the same thing that until now the Ministry of Environment and Forestry as one of the leading sectors related to the GPP policy has not made a road map, only as acknowledged by the informant, the Ministry of Environment and Forestry has made a report in the Indonesian country report, which contains a chronology of development journeys. GPP by KLHK.

Furthermore, other informants also explained that officially there is no road map as a manifestation of the action plan, however, the things that need to be done through the Governor's Regulation and the Governor's Circular regarding the implementation of the GPP have been carried out. The importance of an action plan in implementing a policy, this is related to the idea that the government must have continuous activities (process), the state where the activity takes place (state), the governing official (the duty) and methods, methods and systems (manner, methods and systems) from the government to the community.

Furthermore, in terms of the realm of policy implementing actors, in this case the institution authorized in the policy for the procurement of goods and services, namely LKPP, admits that there is no new road map. Furthermore, the LKPP staff informant said: When asked about the road map, we don't have it because the rules are clear, our activities

are in the form of expanding business opportunities, finally in the KAK the details are through the SPP, there's no official road map. If there is a new document bidding standard. There is already an SPP, it is already in progress. Regarding the policy road map, an informant from the academic side presented the view that issues related to the procurement of environmentally friendly goods and services could become a major issue. Informant says:

The hope is that if this can become a major issue part of the main issues launched by the government, if possible, not only at the provincial government level, it can also be continued by the government at the district city level, so that later it becomes something that needs to be considered together. God willing, if the local government, both provincial and district, sees this as an urgent matter, God willing, the community will be able to follow suit and adapt. The policy road map can at least describe how the direction of a policy is implemented in a planned and programmed manner. The road map which is formally listed in the planning documents is said by an environmental NGO informant to be a strategic issue that is quite important. Further, the informant said:

In the RPJM or the preparation of the RKP, it must be able to answer the problems in South Kalimantan, one of which is what if it is related to a disaster, so that drought does not cause forest and forest fires and does not flood. Can't answer. Because that's the document that will ensure that it happens. In the RPJM. The statement sentence has no legal force. Surgery in the RPJMD. other than the governor's vision and mission, are you included? Because there is a point about the environment. In the RPJM the plan is the budget, for example, in the APBN in the APBD it proves that it is environmentally friendly or not, if Education is 20%, now, what percentage is the environment? This is what is being questioned. So our parameters measure it. Then from the budget planning the parameters are there. In the RPJM there are a number of strategic issue points, the derivatives of this, this program, how much is the budget? It should have been mapped.

The policy road map that contains environmental issues in this GPP policy is very central, considering that the widest type of land use is forest covering an area of 1,109,500.41 ha or about 29.62% of the total area of South Kalimantan. Likewise, environmental conditions in South Kalimantan can be seen from the condition of critical land in the forest. In 2010 critical land in forest is dominated by protected forest covering an area of 134,345 and production forest covering an area of 268,473 ha. This means that protection forests and production forests are critical lands within the forest.

In addition to tracing through interviews with various parties related to this GPP policy, the results of field observations and searches of various data mining facilities have also not found any documents or statements that tend to be a road map for GPP policies in South Kalimantan Province. From various informants' statements, the researcher notes that the most prominent thing in the dimension of the action plan related to the causes of the GPP policy not being optimal in its implementation was the aspect of the GPP policy road map. So in this dimension, the absence of an action plan road map in the GPP policy in South Kalimantan is considered one of the causes for the implementation of the GPP policy not being optimal.

The road map as part of the action plan in this case is closely related to the embodiment of government functions, as it is said that the government basically has three functions, namely: (1) service functions, namely by planning and implementing activities and services to the community with the aim of creating justice in society, (2) development function, namely carrying out the function of planning and implementing development programs with the aim of creating a prosperous society, and (3) empowerment function, namely: by carrying out the function of planning and carrying out community

empowerment activities with the aim of creating an independent society.¹⁸⁶ Likewise regarding the success of the government in carrying out its roles and functions through the implementation of a policy program, in line with what Meter and Horn said that the determinants of the success of a policy can be seen from the planning of 20% (twenty percent) and the implementation of the policy. by 60% (sixty percent), the rest is how to control the implementation.

The action plan, one of which is represented in the road map document, specifically covers planning that emphasizes targets and targets within a certain period of time, so that the implementation of the GPP achieves optimal effectiveness and efficiency, in line with what is emphasized in Presidential Regulation No. 16 of 2018 contained in article 5, namely "(a) improving the quality of planning for the procurement of goods/services". So it can be understood that the action plan is related to stakeholders in formulating policies through certain programs and activities as a form of realizing the achievement of policy objectives.

The government in this case as the policy maker, it is important to make an action plan where the action plan can be used as the basis for policy directions, goals, programs and targets for achieving certain goals within a certain period of time. In this case the road map provides an explanation of the road map of what activities will be carried out or will be achieved during a certain period of time. The road map is also used as a reference for providers of goods and services so that they know the direction and goals of the GPP policy so as to enable providers to prepare matters regarding GPP procedures and provisions.

3.2 Legal Framework

The dimensions of the legal framework relate to various legal foundations, both statutory regulations and regulations that are made and implemented in relation to the implementation of GPP. This dimension includes legal aspects regarding energy consumption and the rules for implementing GPP. Nvivi's data analysis related to the perspective of the legal framework aspect in knowing the causes of the non-optimal implementation of the GPP policy in South Kalimantan, as presented in Table 5.1, it is known that the legal framework theme has the most substance linkages with the government theme as much as 25 times stated in the interview primary data. Likewise, the theme of the legal framework, which has a substance linkage with the theme of systems and infrastructure, was raised 20 times. Then, the analysis map in the project map is shown in Figure 5.2 shows that the government, system and infrastructure are related to the causes of the non-optimal implementation of GPP policies from the perspective of the legal framework.

Regarding the dimensions of the legal framework, the author can convey about the causes of the non-optimal GPP policy, substantially, the average informant said the legal framework of the GPP policy has not been able to make the implementers in this case the government and providers to comply with the provisions of the GPP. One of these is represented by information from informants who stated that not all implementers understand the laws/regulations related to energy consumption.

In line with this, the budget user informants described as follows: Look, today we are still focusing on PDN and UMK, for this PDN we are still verifying TKDN, if the Sibarjasaramling SPP has not been touched. By regulation, it's only implementation that hasn't been included in the REN, I'm not too conforming whether the SPP has been included in the strategic plan or not. Because, in today's application, we are still focused on the results of the red carpet for users for the user-user process from MSEs and then

products that are TKDN, e-catalog, yes, we haven't been there yet, because resources are limited so the focus is still on there.

Likewise, LKPP informants expressed their opinions regarding the dimensions of the legal framework, namely: If you look at the regulations in the Presidential Regulation, we are still somewhat different, if the TKDN is different, so the TKDN of BNP is above 40%... Our tools are still lacking like that. One. So maybe the bleaching steps need to be at the technical level for their respective implementations, say making regulations in the regions, this regulation must use wood which must be legal, that is a technical requirement that must be implemented in the election document. So, if it's been published in the e-catalog, you just have to vote there. Because our decision maker, we choose the SPP, even if it is more expensive, for example, when asked why buy the more expensive one, because it's already SPP.

Furthermore, an informant member of the South Kalimantan provincial legislature added that in fact the legal framework related to the GPP policy already exists, but its implementation is less than optimal. Further informants said: The legal framework is clear from the presidential regulation to the regional regulation and governor's regulation, it's just a matter of whether what is implemented in the field is appropriate or not. If it is felt that the policy needs to be formulated in more detailed technical and operational guidelines, especially according to the road map, why not have a soup in each implementer. It should be.

From various informants' statements, the researcher noted that the most prominent thing in the dimension of the legal framework is that not all GPP policy implementers understand the law related to energy consumption regulations and other regulations related to GPP, and have not fully implemented the legal basis related to GPP. So in this dimension, it is found that the legal framework is one of the reasons why the implementation of GPP policies is not optimal, because the implementers do not understand and implement regulations related to GPP.

Ideally, the legal framework, both in statutory regulations, mandatory, as well as down to the operational and technical guidelines in regulations to the level of implementation in the regions can be clearly understood by all relevant parties. In fact, the legal framework that supports, directs and facilitates the implementation of the GPP. This is the cause of the non-optimal implementation of GPP policies, as the finding that in the absence of a legal framework that allows to support GPP adoption, it may be in the form of government directives or policies that mandate public officials to adopt GPP initiatives. This was allegedly due to the lack of willingness of the relevant parties to take this GPP seriously. This finding was also previously confirmed that the cause of the non-optimal implementation of the GPP was that both developed and developing countries faced the problem of the absence of really strong environmental regulations.

The legal framework is related to the function of government as stated that the government has a regulating function, namely the government regulates all sectors in society with policies in the form of legislation, whether in the form of government regulations, or other regulations. Part of the purpose of this function is to maintain state stability, and state growth as desired. For this reason, the legal framework is proof of the embodiment of the regulatory function of the government, that in carrying out a policy one must rely on clear legal norms, so that every decision and action is always carried out. in the legal corridor.

Furthermore, regarding the legal framework, it was also acknowledged by the informants that a policy that is easy to implement is needed, regional heads and regional officials so that they are more intense in encouraging them to implement them from within

their own offices/homes, so that awareness will increase faster and more quickly to staff in staff and even to society. Of course, reward and punishment is very necessary if you don't comply with the regulations or policies that have been made and after they have been properly socialized.

In the legal framework regarding GPP, it is important to pay attention to the economic and administrative components in the processes of procurement of goods and services in the context of GPP. The legal framework takes into account the dynamic reality of market developments, where the state and other interested parties are actively modernizing the public procurement process. problems faced, the legal framework is not directly aimed at reducing negative impacts on the environment. There are several rules that cannot be applied in practice due to the absence of proper mechanisms (goods from secondary raw materials). The ideal legal framework also needs to be disseminated to all parties related to GPP, this is to strengthen regulations that support the implementation of GPP such as product manufacturers/ environmentally friendly services.

The conditions described by informants' statements regarding the legal framework for implementing GPP policies that require further regulations or regulations as a technical reference for implementation, are in line with the results of research which illustrate that related to the legislative and regulatory framework that for business actors in the procurement of goods and services the government has received socialization related to environmental conservation, but further efforts are needed by making regulations that support providers to start implementing environmentally friendly procurement.

IV. Conclusion

Based on the results of the research and discussion that have been described in the previous section, the researcher can convey the following conclusions: The cause of the non-optimal implementation of GPP policies in the province. South Kalimantan viewed from the perspective of the GPP framework proposed by Akenroye et.al (2013) identified as follows: a) In the perspective of the action plan, implementation has not been optimal due to the absence of a policy road map; b) In the perspective of the legal framework, implementation has not been optimal because the implementers have not understood and implemented regulations related to GPP as well as possible; c) From the perspective of the regulatory and implementing authorities, implementation has not been optimal due to the fact that policy implementers, both actors and providers, do not yet have good expertise, communication and coordination between policy implementers have not gone well, and the role of stakeholder institutions does not have the authority to intervene more. so that GPP is run by both the provider and the actor; d) From the perspective of the dimensions of the ecolabeling scheme, implementation has not been optimal due to the lack of market ecolabelled products, and weak legitimacy to be able to encourage providers and actors in the procurement of goods and services to include and reproduce environmentally friendly green products; e) From the perspective of increasing education and awareness, implementation has not been optimal due to the lack of knowledge and insight of the actors in the procurement of goods and services, as well as socialization of GPP by utilizing various media is still not intense and not massively carried out.

The implementation of GPP policies in South Kalimantan is influenced by several supporting and inhibiting factors in terms of the implementation model perspective of Van Meter and Van Horn (1975), identified as follows: a) In the perspective of standards and policy objectives, policy implementation is supported by regulations that overshadow procurement practices. goods and services within the GPP corridor. However, policy

implementation is hampered by the absence of standardized documents that are technically clear enough and understood by policy actors, as well as low awareness and commitment to the importance of GPP; b) In the perspective of policy sources, policy implementation is supported by the availability of adequate human resources, budget and facilities. However, it is hampered by human resources whose capacity, competence, behavior and commitment have not been maximized. Meanwhile, on the budget side, the GPP policy instrument itself has not been able to direct PA/KPA to better direct the proportion of the budget and choose environmentally friendly products.

References

- Abdullah, Oekan S. (2017). *Ekologi Manusia Dan Pembangunan Berkelanjutan*. Jakarta: Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Agustino, Leo. (2017). *Dasar-Dasar Kebijakan Publik*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Akenroye, Temidayo O., Adekunle Sabitu Oyegoke, and Ama Bassey Eyo. "Development of a Framework for the Implementation of Green Public Procurement in Nigeria." *International Journal of Procurement Management* 6, no. 1 (2013): 1. <http://www.inderscience.com/link.php?id=50607>.
- Alberg Mosgaard, Mette. "Improving the Practices of Green Procurement of Minor Items." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 90 (March 2015): 264–274. <https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0959652614012840>.
- Atmosudirdjo, S. Parjudi. (1981). *Hukum Administrasi Negara*. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia.
- Atmosudirdjo, S. Parjudi. (1981). *Hukum Administrasi Negara*. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia.
- Azis, Iwan J., Lydia M. Napitupulu, Arianto A. Patunru, and Budy P. Resosudarmo, eds. (2010). *Pembangunan Berkelanjutan: Peran Dan Kontribusi Emil Salim*. Jakarta: Kepustakaan Populer Gramedia.
- Badan Pusat Statistik. (2019). *Indikator Pembangunan Berkelanjutan Indonesia 2019*. Jakarta: Badan Pusat Statistik Indonesia.
- Baltabayev, Kuanysh. (2020). "Assessment Of Status And Legal Frameworks Of Sustainable Public Procurement In The Republic Of Kazakhstan." UNEP.
- Blair, Tony. (2005). *Securing the Future: Delivering UK Sustainable Development Strategy*. UK: HM Government.
- Bouwer, Maarten, Margo Jonk, Peter Szuppinger, Helmut Lusser, Tanya Berman, Raffaella Bersani, Vincenzo Nappa, Cosseta Vignano, Ari Nissinen, and Katriina Parikka. *Green Public Procurement in Europe 2006 - Conclusions and Recommendation*. Netherlands: Virage Milieu & Management, 2006.
- Brammer, Stephen, and Helen Walker. "Sustainable Procurement in the Public Sector: An International Comparative Study." *International Journal of Operations & Production Management* 31, no. 4 (March 22, 2011): 452–476. <https://www.emerald.com/insight/content/doi/10.1108/01443571111119551/full/html>.
- Brasz. *Inleiding Tot De Bestuurswetenschap*. Leiden: Vuga Boekerij, 1975.
- Braulio-Gonzalo, Marta, and María D. Bovea. "Criteria Analysis of Green Public Procurement in the Spanish Furniture Sector." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 258 (June 2020): 120704. <https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0959652620307514>.
- Bungin, M. Burhan. *Penelitian Kualitatif: Komunikasi, Ekonomi, Kebijakan Publik Dan Ilmu Sosial Lainnya*. Jakarta: Prenada Media Group, 2011.
- Buniamin, Sharifah, Norkhazimah Ahmad, Fatimah Hanim Abdul Rauf, Nor Hasimah

- Johari, and Azwan Abdul Rashid. "Green Government Procurement Practices (GPP) in Malaysian Public Enterprises." *Procedia Economics and Finance* 35 (2016): 27–34. <https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S221256711600006X>.
- Burja, Alenka. "Using Green Public Procurement (GPP) for Sustainable Consumption and Production." *Journal for European Environmental & Planning Law* 6, no. 3 (2009): 319–338. https://brill.com/view/journals/jeep/6/3/article-p319_4.xml.
- Hill, Michael, and Peter Hupe. *Implementing Public Policy*. London: Sage publications, 2002.
- Ho, Linda W.P., Nicholas M. Dickinson, and Gilbert Y.S. Chan. "Green Procurement in the Asian Public Sector and the Hong Kong Private Sector." *Natural Resources Forum* 34, no. 1 (February 2010): 24–38. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1477-8947.2010.01274.x>.
- Indiahono, Dwiyanto. *Kebijakan Publik Berbasis Dynamic Policy Analysis*. Yogyakarta: Gava Media, 2009.
- International Union for Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources, ed. *World Conservation Strategy: Living Resource Conservation for Sustainable Development*. IUCN–UNEP–WWF, 1980. www.environmentandsociety.org/printpdf/7384.
- Ishak, Inar Ichjana. "Pembangunan Berkelanjutan Dan Pengelolaan Lingkungan Hidup." *Jabarprov.Go.Id*. Last modified 2014. Accessed September 23, 2020. https://jabarprov.go.id/index.php/news/8547/Pembangunan_Berkelanjutan_dan_Pengelolaan_Lingkungan_Hidup.
- Jones, Charles O. *An Introduction to the Study of Public Policy*. Translated by Nasution S. Jakarta: Rajawali Press, 1984.
- Kartasasmita, Ginandjar. *Administrasi Pembangunan*. Jakarta: LP3ES, 1997.
- Kementerian LHK. "Green Public Procurement (GPP) Tingkatkan Kualitas Lingkungan." *Menlhk.Go.Id*. Last modified 2017. http://ppid.menlhk.go.id/siaran_pers/browse/750.
- Sabatier, Paul A. "Top-Down and Bottom-Up Approaches to Implementation Research: A Critical Analysis and Suggested Synthesis." *Journal of Public Policy* 6, no. 1 (January 28, 1986): 21–48. https://www.cambridge.org/core/product/identifier/S0143814X00003846/type/journal_article.
- Sabatier, Paul, and Daniel Mazmanian. "THE IMPLEMENTATION OF PUBLIC POLICY: A FRAMEWORK OF ANALYSIS*." *Policy Studies Journal* 8, no. 4 (January 1980): 538–560. <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1541-0072.1980.tb01266.x>.
- Shakya, Rajesh Kumar. "Green Public Procurement Initiatives in East African Community (EAC)." 148–162, 2019. <http://services.igi-global.com/resolvedoi/resolve.aspx?doi=10.4018/978-1-5225-7083-7.ch007>.
- Siagian, Sondang P. *Administrasi Pembangunan: Konsep, Dimensi Dan Strateginya*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara, 1989.
- Soehartono, Irawan. *Metode Penelitian Sosial*. Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya, 2002.
- Soemendar. "Perkembangan Konsep Ilmu Pemerintahan." In *Seminar IPP Jakarta*. Jakarta: IPP, 1985.
- Syafiie, Inu Kencana. *Ilmu Pemerintahan*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara, 2017.
- Syafri, Wirman, and Setyoko P. Israwan. (2010). *Implementasi Kebijakan Publik Dan Etika Profesi Pamong Praja*. Sumedang: Alqaprint Jatinangor,.
- Testa, Francesco, Eleonora Annunziata, Fabio Iraldo, and Marco Frey. (2016). "Drawbacks and Opportunities of Green Public Procurement: An Effective Tool for Sustainable Production." *Journal of Cleaner Production* 112 (January): 1893–1900.

- <https://linkinghub.elsevier.com/retrieve/pii/S0959652614010312>.
- Van Meter, Donald S., and Carl E. Van Horn. "The Policy Implementation Process." *Administration & Society* 6, no. 4 (February 26, 1975): 445–488. <http://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/009539977500600404>.
- Wahab, Solichin Abdul. (2004). *Analisis Kebijakan: Dari Formulasi Ke Implementasi Kebijakan Negara*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Wasistiono, Sadu. (2013). *Pengantar Ekologi Pemerintahan*. Sumedang: IPDN Press.
- Winarno, Budi. (2002). *Teori dan Proses Kebijakan Publik*. Yogyakarta: Media Pressindo.
- Wolfe, David T., and Dana R. Hermanson. (2004). "The Fraud Diamond: Considering the Four Elements of Fraud." *CPA Journal* 74, no. 12 38–42.

Policy Implementation Green Public Procurement in Sustainable Development in South Kalimantan Province

ORIGINALITY REPORT

24%

SIMILARITY INDEX

22%

INTERNET SOURCES

8%

PUBLICATIONS

6%

STUDENT PAPERS

PRIMARY SOURCES

1	eduvest.greenvest.co.id Internet Source	14%
2	pinpdf.com Internet Source	1%
3	Submitted to Universitas Kristen Satya Wacana Student Paper	1%
4	adri27th.stkipsingkawang.ac.id Internet Source	1%
5	www.coursehero.com Internet Source	1%
6	media.neliti.com Internet Source	1%
7	www.un-page.org Internet Source	1%
8	ejournal.unwaha.ac.id Internet Source	<1%

9

Hari Liewarnata, Bahrullah Akbar, Murtir Jeddawi, Sampara Lukman. "The Implementation of the Government Goods and Services Procurement Policy at the General Hospital of Sanggau Regency West Kalimantan Province", Journal of Public Administration and Governance, 2019

Publication

<1 %

10

A Widiyanto, E Fauziah, Suhartono. "The evaluation of agroforestry development in marginal land area of Gunungkidul, Indonesia", IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science, 2022

Publication

<1 %

11

www.dtic.mil

Internet Source

<1 %

12

eprints.uny.ac.id

Internet Source

<1 %

13

Nenden Maulida Yuliawati, Ichi Ichi, Asep Kurniawan. "THE EFFECT OF E-PROCUREMENT SYSTEM IMPLEMENTATION, COMPETENCE AND COMPENSATION ON EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE OF GOODS/SERVICES PROCUREMENT", ACCRUALS (Accounting Research Journal of Sutaatmadja), 2021

Publication

<1 %

14 Dewi Yustiarini, Biemo W. Soemardi. "A review of corruption in public procurement in Indonesia", IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering, 2020

Publication

<1 %

15 S. Fedyunina, G. Panichkina. "Chapter 3112 Branding's Strategy in Regional Policy", Springer Science and Business Media LLC, 2022

Publication

<1 %

16 Submitted to University of Glasgow

Student Paper

<1 %

17 sloap.org

Internet Source

<1 %

18 www.ijiemjournal.uns.ac.rs

Internet Source

<1 %

19 www.inderscienceonline.com

Internet Source

<1 %

20 Submitted to Queen Mary and Westfield College

Student Paper

<1 %

21 Submitted to iGroup

Student Paper

<1 %

22 www.bdlaw.com

Internet Source

<1 %

23

www.iosrjournals.org

Internet Source

<1 %

24

www.tandfonline.com

Internet Source

<1 %

25

Dedy SV Simanjuntak, Hamzah Hatrik, Lidia Br Karo. "The Efforts Of Bengkulu Regional Police Investigators In Determining Corruption Suspects For Soybean Seed Procurement At Department Of Agriculture Of Bengkulu Province For Fiscal Year 2016", Bengkoelen Justice : Jurnal Ilmu Hukum, 2022

Publication

<1 %

26

Soerjo Soebiandono, Sinta Ningrum, Heru Nurasa, Ramadhan Pancasilawan. "Accountability of the Bureau of Procurement Goods and Services of Banten Province in Implementing E-Procurement", KnE Social Sciences, 2022

Publication

<1 %

27

www.amfiteatruconomic.ro

Internet Source

<1 %

28

R Sulistiowati, S Wahyuni, M K Yunanto, M Elsera, W E Yudiatmaja, T Samnuzulsari. "Community forestry for environmental sustainability and ecotourism: the context and problems in Indonesia", IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science, 2022

<1 %

29

cronfa.swan.ac.uk

Internet Source

<1 %

30

Paula Cayolla Trindade, Paula Antunes, Paulo Partidário. "SPP Toolbox: Supporting Sustainable Public Procurement in the Context of Socio-Technical Transitions", *Sustainability*, 2017

Publication

<1 %

31

Takuro Miyamoto, Naonari Yajima, Takahiro Tsukahara, Toshi H. Arimura. "Advancement of Green Public Purchasing by Category: Do Municipality Green Purchasing Policies Have Any Role in Japan?", *Sustainability*, 2020

Publication

<1 %

Exclude quotes Off

Exclude matches Off

Exclude bibliography On

Policy Implementation Green Public Procurement in Sustainable Development in South Kalimantan Province

GRADEMARK REPORT

FINAL GRADE

/0

GENERAL COMMENTS

Instructor

PAGE 1

PAGE 2

PAGE 3

PAGE 4

PAGE 5

PAGE 6

PAGE 7

PAGE 8

PAGE 9

PAGE 10

PAGE 11

PAGE 12
