

# Promotion Management Through A Merit System In The Education And Training Personnel Agency, Mamasa Regency, West Sulawesi Province

*by Amalia Rizki*

---

**Submission date:** 11-Mar-2023 10:25PM (UTC+0700)

**Submission ID:** 2034682703

**File name:** 2839-Article\_Text-11810-2-10-20221208.pdf (245.77K)

**Word count:** 4277

**Character count:** 25099

## Promotion Management Through A Merit System In The Education And Training Personnel Agency, Mamasa Regency, West Sulawesi Province

Ranteallo Tandirerung<sup>1</sup>, Rizki Amalia\*<sup>2</sup>  
Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri, Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri  
[ranteallot@gmail.com](mailto:ranteallot@gmail.com), [rizkiamalia@ipdn.ac.id](mailto:rizkiamalia@ipdn.ac.id)

### ABSTRACT

Job promotion is one of the activities of the State Civil Apparatus Management. It is implemented through a merit system to obtain employees with qualifications, competencies, and performance fairly and equitably to occupy a higher position. This study aimed to identify and analyze job promotion management through the merit system at the Education and Training Personnel Agency, commonly known as *Badan Kepegawaian Pendidikan dan Pelatihan (BKPP)* in Mamasa Regency, West Sulawesi Province. A qualitative descriptive method was used to analyze promotion management with aspects such as (1) planning, (2) organizing, (3) implementation, and (4) supervision.

The results showed that job promotion management through the merit system has been running well regarding organization and supervision, but there are obstacles in the planning and implementation aspects. Therefore, it is necessary to make a Regent's or Regional Regulation based on local considerations. There is also a need for consistency in public information disclosure in job promotions that use competency tests.

**Keywords:** Promotion, Management, Merit System

### Introduction

Various highlights arise due to unproductive and indisciplined employees' performance. This requires serious management to improve the quality through bureaucratic reform. According to George Terry in Sukarna (2011:7), the fundamental management functions comprise planning, organizing, actuating, and controlling. Sedarmayanti (2009:71) stated that bureaucratic reform is the government's effort to improve performance through various means to realize effectiveness, efficiency, and accountability.

Indonesian Presidential Regulation Number 81 of 2010 concerning the Grand Design of Bureaucratic Reform 2010-2025 states that bureaucratic reform creates a professional government bureaucracy with adaptive characteristics, integrity, and high performance. The bureaucracy is clean and free from Corruption Collusion Nepotism (CCN), able to serve the public, is neutral, prosperous, dedicated, and upholds the state apparatus' basic values and code of ethics. To support

9  
\*Corresponding author  
Rizki Amalia  
Institut Pemerintahan Dalam Negeri  
[rizkiamalia@ipdn.ac.id](mailto:rizkiamalia@ipdn.ac.id)  
Phone: 085294986209

Received: October 6, 2022  
Revised: October 30, 2022  
Accepted: November 15, 2022  
Available Online: December 5, 2022

17  
this bureaucratic reform, the government issued Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus. In the future, all government agencies are expected to have officers with integrity, professionalism, and neutrality. The officers should not follow practical politics, be clean from 19  
Corruption, Collusion, and Nepotism, have good welfare and be able to provide public services according to community expectations.

6  
Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus regulates a merit system. All resource management policies are regulated based on qualifications, competencies, and good performance appraisals fairly and equitably. This system does not discriminate against background, 24  
race, ethnicity, skin color, religion, origin, gender, age, or disability. It opens up opportunities for anyone with the ability to self-development.

The open Promotion System for the State Civil Apparatus is among the nine Action Plans Acceleration. According to NitiseMITO (2000:71), promotion implies moving to a higher position. 16  
Hasibuan (2000:44) stated that the open method is when the withdrawal is informed by advertising in print and electronic mass media, becoming widely disseminated to the public. This program is a position filling using a merit system of a competency-based and transparent recruitment and promotion apparatus. This is in line with Pyness (2009: 187) that most public entities and nonprofits post open positions and accept applications on the Web sites provided. Furthermore, 14  
this statement supports Davidson et al. in Berman (2010:94) that over 50% of initial applications for government positions are conducted online. 4

8  
Development paradigm or e-government in government could significantly reduce corruption and inefficiencies while increasing transparency and accountability. In line with this, 8  
Anderson (2015: V) stated that a national ICT strategy in government and e-government could significantly reduce government waste, corruption, and inefficiencies while increasing transparency and accountability.

3  
Open promotion is conducted to obtain competitive government officials to improve the apparatus' resource quality. Competence-based and transparent recruitment and promotion is a selection process for State Civil Apparatus to occupy certain positions. This is conducted through an objective selection process to produce competent, integrity, professional, high-performing, and moral State Civil Apparatus. The process is carried out to anticipate the leadership of an unprofessional agency inconsistent with the competencies and background abilities required for position qualifications. This selection process requires the apparatus to fulfil the predetermined requirements to ensure a match between position qualification and competence. 3

The available data showed that the agency has carried out several promotions. This study focused on the position promotion implemented by the Education and Training Personnel Agency 6

of Mamasa Regency in 2019. The promotions through the merit system used a competency test to fill two positions. In Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning the Management of Civil Servants, a promotion must be based on a merit system. This system is a policy and management of the State Civil Apparatus based on the qualifications, competencies, and performance fairly and equitably. It is used in promotions to obtain qualified, well-performing, and competent civil servants able to lead government sections, units, or agencies. Therefore, it is expected that no political intervention would change a civil servant's placement policy.

Table 1 shows the positions filled through the merit system at the Education and Training Personnel Agency of Mamasa Regency:

**Table 1**  
**Positions Filled Through the Merit System at the Education and Training Personnel Agency of Mamasa Regency**

No.	Position
(1)	(2)
1.	Head of Procurement, Pension, and Personnel Information
2.	Head of Sub-Division of Formation, Procurement, and Facilitation of the State Civil Apparatus Professional Institute

Source: Mutation and Promotion Section of Education and Training Personnel Agency in Mamasa Regency, 2022

Several problems were encountered in implementing the promotion in Mamasa Regency in 2019. One of the problems was the absence of clear regulations regarding job promotion activities. Promotion through a merit system, such as the Regent's Regulation, only refers to laws and other provisions. For instance, job promotion refers to Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning the Management of Civil Servants. Another problem is that the competency test results were not announced openly to employees that took the test. The results were directly submitted to the leadership. Therefore, this study aimed to identify and analyze the promotion management through the merit system at the Education and Training Personnel Agency, Mamasa Regency, West Sulawesi Province.

## Method

This study used a descriptive qualitative method with an inductive approach. According to Sugiyono (2012:1), qualitative method examines the condition of natural objects with the study as the key instrument. Data were collected by triangulation and analyzed inductively to obtain

generalized results. Nazir (2014: 43) also stated that the descriptive method examines the present status of people, objects, conditions, thought systems, or events. Data were collected using triangulation techniques, in-depth interviews, observations, and documentation. This study used ten informants comprising Assistant I for Government, Head of <sup>12</sup> Education and Training Personnel Agency, Secretary of Education and Training Personnel Agency, Head of Transfer and Information, Head of Sub-division of Transfers and Promotions, Civil Servants participating in promotions, and Human Resources involved in managing promotions through the merit system. The informants were determined using the Purposive Sampling Technique, where the data sources were with certain considerations (Sugiyono, 2018: 218). The data were analyzed through reduction, presentation, and conclusions (Miles and Huberman in Silalahi, 2012: 339)

## Result And Discussion

The promotion through the merit system <sup>1</sup> at the Education and Training Personnel Agency of Mamasa Regency must be managed according to the existing provisions. This is because promotion implies appreciating civil servants with the required qualifications and work performance. Furthermore, it is expected there would be no difference in treatment for employees who receive promotions based on ethnicity, religion, race, and class considerations. This study aimed to analyzed <sup>2</sup> the management of promotions through the merit system. It explained the observed focus by referring to the theory proposed by George Terry in Sukarna (2011:6) and comparing it with field reality as follows:

### A. Planning Aspect

Planning is an activity arranged in an organization to guide the process of identifying the results to be achieved and ensure that the goals are realized properly. It is needed to overcome possible obstacles, and the things required to realize its implementation are supported by relevant information. Furthermore, planning ensures that activities are performed effectively and efficiently to realize maximum accomplishments.

Promotional activities through a merit system are conducted to fill a position. These activities require an SOP as a reference for them to run well. Based on the interviews and observations results, the SOP still refers to the law and provisions related to job promotion activities. There are no Regent or Regional Regulations governing promotions in Mamasa Regency. According to Wibowo & Soeprihantanto (2020), an open promotion lacks a strong legal basis. Azhzhahiri (2012) also found that <sup>1</sup> open tender at the Ministry of Administrative Reform and

Bureaucratic Reform has not worked as expected. This is due to the absence of clear regulations regarding open-bid recruitment.

There is a need for regulations regarding promotions implemented by the Mamasa Regency Government. This is because they outline the laws and government regulations that discuss promotions based on local considerations. Regent or Regional Regulations could be used by the performance appraisal team in making SOP for promotions.

The budget size also influences the course of promotion activities. Based on interviews and observations, every promotional activity is accompanied by inaugurations. The Education and Training Personnel Agency has attempted to regulate the costs needed to make promotion activities more efficient. The agency prioritizes employees' competency tests at the beginning of the fiscal year to maximize the budget required for these activities.

The inauguration of a position should call employees to be inducted, witnesses, clergy, and other parties. The activity must also print and budget for needs such as billboards and invitations. When the budget does not meet the needs, several items may not be implemented in the promotion. Therefore, the budget needed to carry out promotion activities must be planned properly and carefully.

Any activity, including the promotion implementation, must require a budget to determine the costs. Planning is important to determine the things needed and provided for in the promotion implementation. Every promotion through a merit system should have a competency test to determine a person's suitability for placement. This competency test was conducted during the promotion in 2019. The activities should be carried out continuously and consistently. This is in line with Daniarsyah (2017) that State Civil Apparatus have high performance when the merit system is implemented consistently in its management.

## **B. Organizing Aspect**

Organizing is the determination, grouping, and preparation of resources to achieve the desired goal. It is carried out to turn any planning into real action. For the organization to run well, the available human resources, facilities, and infrastructure used must be divided according to its designation. The human resources involved must be placed in sections according to their capabilities for the implementation to run as expected. Moreover, the facilities must be available and usable to avoid difficulties in carrying out the activities.

The interviews, observations, and data showed that professional human resources had been placed in implementing promotion activities through the merit system at the Education and Training Personnel Agency. In this process, several employees who understand computer

operation are involved. Not all employees are involved because they have other duties and responsibilities.

Table 1.2 shows the human resources involved in the promotion of positions at the Office of the Education and Training Personnel Agency:

**Table 2**  
**Human Resources Involved in Job Promotion Activities**

No	Job description	HR Involved
(1)	(2)	(3)
1	Performance Assessment Team	Five people
2	Registration	Three people
3	Academics	Seven people
4	Computer technician	Three people
	Total	18 people

Source: Mutation and Promotion Section of the Education and Training Personnel Agency of Mamasa Regency, 2022

From Table 1.2, the human resources involved in promotion activities include the Performance Assessment Team, Registration Section, Academics, and Computer Technicians. They are involved in ensuring that the promotion through the merit system is performed smoothly. People have expertise in determining the human resources to support promotion through the merit system. Each person employed is carefully selected and placed according to the requirements of the work to be performed. The human resources involved are tasked with working effectively and efficiently.

The computer technicians entrusted with this activity are able to use computers well to input and update large amounts of data. They overcome any technical obstacles in the operation of each technology used. The Mamasa Regency Government collaborated with outside parties from academia in implementing promotions, specifically in the competency test participated by promoted employees. Competency tests are important to know the employee profile results and are a reference to place employees according to their competencies.

Equipment resources also have a role in promoting activities, including available facilities and infrastructure. Supporting facilities determine the success of implementing the work apparatus' duties and responsibilities (Arifah & Amalia, 2021). Table 1.3 shows the equipment resources used at the Education and Training Personnel Agency:

**Table 3**  
**Equipment Resources Used in Promotion**

No	Equipment Resources	Total
(1)	(2)	(3)
1	Lodging	7 Rooms
2	Car	2 Unit
3	Computer	4 Set
4	Printer	4 Unit
5	Banner	2 Unit
6	Paper	7 Rim
7	Snowman Pen	10 Box (12 pcs)
8	Table	50 Unit
9	Chair	50 Unit
10	Room	3 Rooms
11	Speaker	3 set

Source: Mutation and Promotion Section of Mamasa Regency Education and Training Personnel Agency, 2022

3  
The interviews, observations, and available data showed that the Education and Training Personnel Agency had prepared the necessary facilities, such as lodging, consumption, and transportation. The agency also prepares electronic devices, such as computers and printers, which should be used properly during the competency test.

Equipment such as paper, pens, and other stationery must be in sufficient quantities. A lack of equipment resources hampers the promotion activities through the merit system. The fulfilment of all facilities speeds up the promotion process and makes it easier for everyone involved.

### C. Implementation Aspect

Implementation is an action taken to continue the activities set in planning and organizing to achieve the goals set. It must focus on the target because activities not directed at the target waste labor, money, time, and materials used. Furthermore, previous planning and organizing become meaningless when not implemented. This means that implementation runs when the human resources involved conduct each stage using every resource, equipment, or supporting facility.

The implementation of promotion through a merit system requires a regulatory mechanism. In this case, the promotion mechanism entails procedures in determining employees to occupy positions according to their competencies. This mechanism requires the employees promoted to pass through some stages.



The interviews, observations, and available data showed that the promotion mechanism through the merit system at <sup>3</sup> the Education and Training Personnel Agency includes:

- a. <sup>7</sup> The Head of Mutation and Development of the Education and Training Personnel Agency of Masama Regency conducts an inventory of structural positions to be filled.
- b. <sup>7</sup> The Education and Training Personnel Agency of Masama Regency writes to all regional apparatus organizations and performance appraisal teams regarding the vacancies to be filled soon.
- c. Based on the letter, each regional apparatus organization employee prepares files according to the requirements needed for the position before taking the competency test.
- d. The Performance Assessment Team holds a meeting to discuss the timing and series of competency tests. The team selects prospective employees to fill structural position vacancies according to the terms and conditions.
- e. The Performance Appraisal Team assesses employees based on the competency test and assessment results. These results are submitted to the Regent as the staffing officer to determine which employees would fill the vacant positions.

The promotion mechanism runs the promotion flow to ensure the process runs smoothly. All employees determine the job vacancies through a letter made by the Education and Training Personnel Agency. They have the right to participate in promotions with no prohibitions, provided they fulfil the terms and conditions of the position. Furthermore, the mechanism includes a performance appraisal team that determines the time and activities in the competency test taken by employees.

The competency test lasted for three days because it was taken by many employees. The assessment team must have real data about exam results, performance, and other things that strengthen the considerations. In promotional activities, the Education and Training Personnel Agency collaborates with outside parties from the academic field in conducting competency tests. The aim is to determine the intellectual abilities of employees to be promoted to vacant positions.

The competency test is conducted on employees' psychology through interviews. The performance appraisal team uses the test results as evaluation material in determining the employee to be promoted. These results are reported to the Personnel Guidance Officer to determine the person to fill the vacant position.

<sup>10</sup> The assessment is based on the competency test results and <sup>10</sup> the requirements to occupy a position according to applicable regulations. A <sup>10</sup> competency test is a requirement in the promotion to be appointed to a position. The test results are used to evaluate <sup>10</sup> the employees' capability of

being given new responsibilities. They help determine the completeness of the requirements that have been fulfilled.

The interviews and observations showed that one factor to be used as an assessment is the employees' work experience. A civil servant appointed for the first time must be a staff for four years to become Echelon IV. To become Echelon III, staff must go through Echelon IV for another three years. <sup>15</sup> This is in line with Government Regulation No. 11 of 2017 concerning the Management of Civil Servants. Furthermore, there are rules governing requirements and appointments. To be appointed to Echelon III or Administrator Position, one must have a minimum of three years of work experience in the Echelon IV or Supervisory Position. This is contained in Article 54, paragraph 1 (d). Furthermore, in Article 54, paragraph 3 (d), one must have a minimum work experience of four years as a staff or Implementing Position to become Echelon IV or Supervisory Position. This shows that an employee to be promoted must have work experience regulated by government regulations.

<sup>20</sup> The implementation of promotions through the merit system at the Education and Training Personnel Agency of Mamasa Regency in 2019 is quite well but not yet optimal. Agency did not disclose information to the public when announcing the competency test results. This supports <sup>4</sup> Amalia (2020) that the Ministry of Administrative Reform and State Apparatus Empowerment has not made public information disclosure in announcing the open selection of the State Civil Apparatus. Furthermore, <sup>4</sup> Setiawan, Jackson, and Putri (2016) found that the open selection of <sup>4</sup> Primary High Leadership officials in the Bandar Lampung City Government was hindered by the absence of open information for the public to determine the <sup>13</sup> candidates to be appointed or promoted.

The announcement competency must be submitted to participants. <sup>1</sup> This is in line with <sup>1</sup> Ma'Ruf (2018:274), that based on Government Regulation, the selection must openly. Therefore, public information disclosure is a process and a form of public accountability.

#### **D. Supervision Aspect**

Supervision is important in overseeing all activities and is aimed at the targets made to take the corrective evaluation. The terms supervision, control, and management are generally interpreted the same (Sururama, R dan Amalia, 2020). Supervision tests whether the implementation is orderly and directed. When planning, organizing, and implementing are not supervised, it may be difficult to achieve the goals set. Hasibuan (2001:241) stated that new goals are known to be achieved properly through supervision or assessment.

Supervision controls the implementation and could be improved when the process is running to achieve more focused results. Evaluation is also needed to collect information about promotions to be used as an alternative in deciding on the appointment of a position. Although evaluation is not only conducted by the government, it could also be carried out by the community to obtain State Civil Apparatus, in line with Mariana (2017) that the government and the public could supervise state apparatus applicable. The evaluation helps apparatus's that fairly firmly.

The interviews and observations found that the evaluation has been conducted and reported to the Personnel Guidance Officer but not verbally. This evaluation is about changes in consideration of employees proposed for promotions. Similarly, a fairly good evaluation was conducted on the promotion in 2022. The Education and Training Personnel Agency has announced online, enabling the public and participants to access the competency test results at each stage. This is seen in the Announcement Letter Number 24/PANSEL JPTP-BKPP/IV/2022 concerning Track Record Assessment in the Context of Open Selection <sup>3</sup> for Primary High Leadership Positions within the Mamasa Regency Government in 2022. It is also seen in the Announcement Letter Number 23/PANSEL JPTP-BKPP/IV/2022 regarding the Competency Assessment Assessment in the Framework of the Open Selection <sup>13</sup> of Primary High Leadership Positions for the Mamasa Regency Government in 2022. The scores and names of participants are listed alphabetically in the two announcement letters.

## Conclusion

<sup>2</sup> This study found that the management of promotion through the merit system <sup>1</sup> at the Education and Training Personnel Agency of Masama Regency, West Sulawesi Province, has been effective regarding organization and supervision. However, the planning and implementation aspects still need improvement. In the organizational aspect, the agency has placed professional human resources overseeing promotion activities through a merit system. The human resources include a Performance Assessment Team, a registration section, academics, and computer technicians. Equipment resources are also used in promotion activities through a merit system. Regarding supervision, the agency has evaluated and reported to the Personnel Guidance Officer. In the planning aspect, no Regent or Regional Regulations govern promotions based on local considerations. This is also reflected in the implementation aspect, where no public information is disclosed in announcing the competency test results. Therefore, there is a need for a Regent or Regional Regulation based on local considerations. Consistency is also needed in public information disclosure in job promotions that use competency tests.

## References

### A. Books

- Alex S, Nitisemito, (2000). *Manajemen Personalia: Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*, Ed. 3. Jakarta: Ghalia Indonesia.
- Anderson, Dennis. (2015). *E-Government Strategy, ICT and Innovation for Citizen Engagement*. New York: Springer.
- Amalia, R. (2020). Open Selection Management in Realizing Asn With Integrity and Excellence in the Ministry of Administrative Reform and Bureaucracy Reform. *Sosiohumaniora*, 22(2), 155–163. <https://doi.org/10.24198/sosiohumaniora.v22i2.26279>
- Arifah, S. B. N., & Amalia, R. (2021). Kompetensi Aparatur Dalam Upaya Melayani Perizinan Elektronik Di Dinas Penanaman Modal Dan Pelayanan Terpadu Satu Pintu Kabupaten Barito Utara Provinsi Kalimantan Tengah. *Jurnal MSDA (Manajemen Sumber Daya Aparatur)*, 9(2), 71–88. <https://doi.org/10.33701/jmsda.v9i2.1988>
- Azhzhahiri, B. (2012). Recruitment Analysis Through Open Bidding Announcement in the Selection of Prospective Echelon II. *BISNIS & BIROKRASI: Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Dan Organisasi*, 19(3), 226–231. <https://doi.org/10.20476/jbb.v19i3.1870>
- Berman, Evan M, (2010). *Human Resources Management in Public Service: Paradoxes, Process, and Problems*. Sage Publications, Inc.
- Daniarsyah, D. (2017). Penerapan Sistem Merit Dalam Rekrutmen Terbuka Promosi Jabatan Pimpinan Tinggi ASN (Suatu Pemikiran Kritis Analisis). *Jurnal Civil Service*, 11(2), 39–48.
- Hasibuan, Malayu S.P, (2000). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia*, Edisi Revisi. Jakarta: PT. Bumi Aksara.
- , (2001). *Manajemen (Dasar, Pengertian dan Masalah)*. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara.
- Ma'Ruf, Jasman J. (2018). *Assessment Center*, Pedoman Uji Kompetensi Jabatan Pimpinan Tinggi. Jakarta: PT. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.
- Mariana, D. (2017). Aparatur Sipil Negara Dan Reformasi Birokrasi. *Jurnal Ilmu Politik | Volume 22, No.1, Tahun 2017 | Hlm. 91-104*, 22.
- Nazir. (2014). *Metode Penelitian*. Bogor : Ghalia Indonesia
- Oglando Setiawan, Charles Jackson, Maria Eka Putri (2016). Pelaksanaan Seleksi Terbuka Pejabat Pimpinan Tinggi Pratama di Lingkungan Pemerintah Kota Bandar Lampung. *Jurnal Ilmiah Hukum Administrasi Negara*, 3(4).
- Pynes, J.E. (2009). *Human Resources Management for Public and Nonprofit Organizations, a strategic Approach*. New York: Jossey-Bass.

Sedarmayanti. (2009). *Reformasi Administrasi Publik, Reformasi Birokrasi dan Kepemimpinan Masa Depan*, Bandung: PT Refika Aditama.

Silalahi, Ulber. (2012). *Metode Penelitian Sosial*. 3 ed. Bandung: Refika Aditama

Sugiyono, (2012). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif dan R & D*. Bandung: Alfabeta

\_\_\_\_\_,(2018). *Metode Penelitian Bisnis: Pendekatan Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, Kombinasi, dan R&D*. Bandung: Alfabeta.

Sukarna. (2011). *Dasar-Dasar Manajemen*. Bandung: Mandar Maju

Sururama, R dan Amalia, R. (2020). *Pengawasan Pemerintahan*. Bandung: CV. Cendikia-Press.

Wibowo, Galih., & B.Soeprihattanto. (2020). *Manajemen Inovasi: Promosi Dalam Mendukung Sistem Merit di BKD Provinsi Jawa Barat*. *Jurnal Manajemen Publik & Kebijakan Publik 2, 1-10*.

## **B. Legislation**

Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus

Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning the Management of Civil Servants

Indonesian Presidential Regulation Number 81 of 2010 concerning the Grand Design of Bureaucratic Reform in 2010-2025

# Promotion Management Through A Merit System In The Education And Training Personnel Agency, Mamasa Regency, West Sulawesi Province

## ORIGINALITY REPORT

**20%**  
SIMILARITY INDEX

**19%**  
INTERNET SOURCES

**13%**  
PUBLICATIONS

**4%**  
STUDENT PAPERS

## PRIMARY SOURCES

<b>1</b>	<b>eprints2.ipdn.ac.id</b> Internet Source	<b>4%</b>
<b>2</b>	<b>eprints.ipdn.ac.id</b> Internet Source	<b>3%</b>
<b>3</b>	<b>ojs.uma.ac.id</b> Internet Source	<b>2%</b>
<b>4</b>	<b>jurnal.unpad.ac.id</b> Internet Source	<b>2%</b>
<b>5</b>	<b>Submitted to Universitas Negeri Padang</b> Student Paper	<b>1%</b>
<b>6</b>	<b>journal.iapa.or.id</b> Internet Source	<b>1%</b>
<b>7</b>	<b>Roni Pujiantari, Dwi Wahyudiati. "Analisis Perencanaan dan Rekrutmen Guru pada Dinas Pendidikan Kabupaten Lombok Tengah", PALAPA, 2022</b> Publication	<b>1%</b>

8	Dennis Anderson, Robert Wu, June-Suh Cho, Katja Schroeder. "E-Government Strategy, ICT and Innovation for Citizen Engagement", Springer Nature, 2015 Publication	1 %
9	<a href="http://ejournal.ipdn.ac.id">ejournal.ipdn.ac.id</a> Internet Source	1 %
10	<a href="http://doaj.org">doaj.org</a> Internet Source	<1 %
11	<a href="http://www.rsisinternational.org">www.rsisinternational.org</a> Internet Source	<1 %
12	<a href="http://journal.stmikglobal.ac.id">journal.stmikglobal.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
13	<a href="http://online-journal.unja.ac.id">online-journal.unja.ac.id</a> Internet Source	<1 %
14	Submitted to Laureate Higher Education Group Student Paper	<1 %
15	Syamsul Bahri, Mansyur Ramly, Achmad Gani, St. Sukmawati. "Organizational Commitment and Civil Servants Performance: The Contribution of Intelligence, Local Wisdom and Organizational Culture", European Journal of Business and Management Research, 2021 Publication	<1 %

16

Internet Source

&lt;1 %

17

[www.ojs.unm.ac.id](http://www.ojs.unm.ac.id)

Internet Source

&lt;1 %

18

[www.ijair.id](http://www.ijair.id)

Internet Source

&lt;1 %

19

Mukmin Muhammad, La Ode Husen. "State Civil Apparatus in Indonesia in the Conception of Welfare State: A Study of Legal Material Law Number 5 Year 2014 on State Civil Apparatus", Asian Social Science, 2019

Publication

&lt;1 %

20

Valentin Laura Sampe, Andi Rasdiyanti, Sitti Khadijah Herdayani Darsim. "Reform of Human Resources Management Through Merit System at West Java Regional Personnel Agency", KnE Social Sciences, 2022

Publication

&lt;1 %

21

[eudl.eu](http://eudl.eu)

Internet Source

&lt;1 %

22

Khairudin Khairudin, Wiyarni Wiyarni. "The Effectiveness of the Equalizing Supervisory Positions to Functional Positions Using Assessment Center in the North Penajam Paser Regency, East Kalimantan, Indonesia", American Journal of Industrial and Business Management, 2023

&lt;1 %



23 [jurnal.untag-sby.ac.id](http://jurnal.untag-sby.ac.id) <1 %  
Internet Source

---

24 [saudijournals.com](http://saudijournals.com) <1 %  
Internet Source

---

25 [www.researchgate.net](http://www.researchgate.net) <1 %  
Internet Source

---

26 Rizki Amalia, Sadu Wasistiono, Ella Lesmanawati Wargadinata, Rossy Lambelanova. "OPEN SELECTION OF STATE CIVIL APPARATUS IN THE MINISTRY OF ADMINISTRATIVE AND BUREAUCRATIC REFORM", Journal of Public Administration and Governance, 2019 <1 %  
Publication

---

Exclude quotes On

Exclude matches Off

Exclude bibliography On